

EXHIBIT B

Brooks, Jeff

Volume 1 - 01/23/2020

Summary Proceeding with Highlighted Clips

Printed 05/23/2021 01:38AM CDT

CONFIDENTIAL

P counter-counters
(Runtime - 00h:08m:25s)

Defense Counters
(Runtime - 00h:51m:52s)

Plaintiffs Designation
(Runtime - 00h:18m:31s)

Defense Objections (Runtime
- 00h:01m:33s)

Plaintiffs Objections
(Runtime - 00h:10m:49s)

Page 00007

01: THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This begins the video
02: deposition of Jeff Brooks as PMK for Chart, Inc.,
03: being taken in the matter of Pacific -- In Re:
04: Pacific Fertility Center Litigation. Today's date
Plaintiffs Objections Objection starts with "The time":
05: is January 23rd, 2020. The time on the record is
06: 9:19 a.m. My name is Brandyon Brantley. I'm the
07: videographer. The court reporter is Laura MacKay.

Page 00008

10: Could you please state your full name for
11: the record.
12: A. Jeffrey Steven Brooks.

Page 00009

13: Mr. Brooks, do you understand that today
14: Chart, Inc., has designated you to testify on its
15: behalf?
16: A. Yes.
17: Q. Okay. And are you willing to testify on
18: Chart's behalf today?
19: A. Yes.
20: Q. And in addition, we've also noticed your
21: deposition in your individual capacity. For
22: purposes of today the majority of our questions I
23: think will be to you as Chart's witness, and you
24: should assume the questions are directed at Chart,
25: unless indicated otherwise, as a means of

(continued page 00010)

0010

01: differentiating between Chart and your individual
02: testimony.

Plaintiffs Objections 402/403 - relevance, waste of time:

03: MR. SMITH: I'll just object to that to the
04: extent it's not clear. I'll make an objection at
05: the time.
06: BY MS. ZEMAN:
07: Q. Mr. Brooks, what did you do to prepare for
08: your deposition today?
09: A. I looked at several binders full of emails
10: and other documents.

Page 00013

02: Q. Mr. Brooks, do you have a college degree?
03: A. I do.
04: Q. And what is that degree?
05: A. It's a bachelor of science in mechanical
06: engineering technology.

Page 00013

11: Q. And who is your current employer?
12: A. Chart, Incorporated.
13: Q. And what's your position with Chart,
14: Incorporated?
15: A. I am currently titled innovation engineer.
16: Q. And what is an innovation engineer?
17: A. We do new product development.
18: Q. And how long have you been an innovation
19: engineer?
20: A. About six years.
21: Q. Were you with Chart before then?
22: A. Yes.
23: Q. What was your position with Chart before
24: the innovation engineer?
25: A. Sustaining engineer.

(continued page 00014)

0014

01: Q. And what does a sustaining engineer do?

02: A. Sustaining engineer does continuous

03: improvement on the product and maintaining

04: documentation like bills of material and drawings

05: and such.

06: Q. Did you work with the MVE 808 in that

07: position?

08: A. Yes.

09: Q. In what ways?

10: A. As the sustaining engineer in product

11: engineering.

12: Q. What did you do specifically regarding the

13: MVE 808 as a sustaining engineer?

14: MR. SMITH: Overbroad.

15: BY MS. ZEMAN:

16: Q. You can answer.

17: A. It was mainly sustaining activity:

18: maintaining bills of material and drawings.

19: Q. Did you make any changes to the drawings?

20: A. There were changes to drawings, yes.

21: Q. What sort of changes did you make to the

22: drawings of the MVE 808?

23: A. Miscellaneous, you know, sometimes to

24: clarify material requirements or assembly

25: requirements.

(continued page 00015)

0015

01: Q. So assembly requirements. What did you say

02: for that?

03: A. Material requirements.

04: Q. What sort of material requirements changed?

05: A. Sometimes it would be material length.

06: Sometimes width. I mean, just minor size changes,

07: typically. It's mature product, and very little

08: maintenance was actually done to it.

09: Q. What do you mean by a "mature product"?

10: A. It was developed in the '80s or the '70s,

11: probably, and no substantial changes have been done

12: to it since that time.

13: Q. Can you give me some examples of the

14: changes that have been made to it?

15: A. The only significant change would be the

16: addition of annular lines for -- to allow the use of

17: differential pressure sensor for the controller.

18: Q. When were those added?

19: A. That would have been in the mid-'90s.

20: Q. And the tank has two annular lines,

21: correct?

22: A. Correct.

23: Q. Were both of the lines added in the

24: mid-'90s?

25: A. Yes.

(continued page 00016)

0016

01: Q. And you referred to continuous

02: improvements. What does that mean?

03: A. That generally means minor changes that

04: would allow production to produce the -- the product

05: easier, quicker, or to improve the user interface.

06: Q. Would the addition of the annular lines be

07: considered a continuous improvement?

08: A. Yes.

09: Q. And were there any other significant

10: changes to the MVE 808?

11: A. None that I recall.

12: Q. Have the materials used to construct the

13: MVE 808 changed?

14: A. No.

15: Q. Not since it was initially designed in the

16: '70s or '80s?

17: A. Not since I've become involved with the

18: product in the early '90s. I can't speak to what

19: might have happened before I became involved with

20: the product.

Plaintiffs Objections 402/403 - relevance, waste of time:

21: Q. Okay. And during what time period were you

22: assisting engineer?

23: A. Could you restate that, please.

24: Q. During what time period did you serve as a

25: sustaining engineer at Chart?

(continued page 00017)

0017

01: A. I don't remember years very well anymore.

02: They all kind of run together. But I was sustaining

03: engineer for about five or six years before I became

04: an innovation engineer, and that was -- so it was

05: probably 10 or 15 years ago. Probably closer to 15,

06: when I became -- a sustaining engineer became my

07: title.

08: Q. Okay. And were you with Chart before you

09: were a sustaining engineer?

10: A. I was.

11: Q. Okay. And what was your position?
12: A. Product engineer.
13: Q. And how long were you a product engineer?
14: A. Probably ten years.
15: Q. And what did you do as a product engineer?
16: A. The same thing as I did as a sustaining
17: engineer. That was -- that title change was not a
18: job change. It was just a title change.
19: Q. Okay. Is that true for your entire period
20: as a product engineer, that the work is comparable
21: to what you did as a sustaining engineer?
22: A. Yes.
23: Q. And were you with Chart before you were a
24: product engineer?
25: A. Yes.

(continued page 00018)

0018

01: Q. What were you before a product engineer?
02: A. I was a lab technician.
03: Q. How long were you a lab technician?
04: A. Probably five years. Well, make that
05: three.
06: Q. And what did you do as a lab technician?
07: A. Testing of materials and finished product
08: and components that go into the product.

Page 00018

Plaintiffs Objections 402 relevance; 403 waste of time :

22: Q. Okay. And were you with Chart before you
23: were a lab technician?
24: A. No.
25: Q. When did you start with Chart?

(continued page 00019)

0019

01: A. I started at this location before it became

02: Chart in 1989.

03: Q. Were you with MVE?

04: A. I was with CSI Cryogenic Services.

05: Q. How did CSI come to be a Chart location?

06: A. MVE purchased CSI two years after I went to

07: work there, about two years after I went to work

08: there, and then Chart purchased MVE in the mid to

09: late '90s.

10: Q. So you started with CSI in 1989?

11: A. Correct.

12: Q. And, then, CSI was purchased by MVE in

13: maybe 1991 or so?

14: A. Yes.

15: Q. Okay. And then mid to late '90s, CSI was

16: purchased by Chart?

17: A. Yes.

18: Q. MVE was purchased by Chart.

19: A. Yes.

20: Q. Okay. And what was your position with CSI

21: when you started in 1989?

22: A. Lab technician.

23: Q. Is that the lab technician position that

24: you described earlier?

25: A. Yes.

Page 00020

Plaintiffs Objections 402/403 - relevance, waste of time, cumulative:

12: Q. The MVE 808 is a vacuum-insulated freezer,

13: correct?

14: A. Correct.

15: Q. Can you describe what that means?

16: A. That means that it has an inner and outer

17: wall that is sealed and evacuated to provided

18: insulation, thermal insulation.

19: Q. Does that mean the vacuum space provides

20: the insulation?

21: A. The vacuum space provides the bulk of the

22: insulation, yes.

23: Q. What else provides the insulation?

24: A. There's a multi-layer insulation system

25: wrapped around the inner container before it is

(continued page 00021)

0021

01: placed in the outer container.

02: Q. Does that insulation reside inside the

03: vacuum space?

04: A. It does.

05: Q. So the vacuum plus the insulation accounts

06: for the insulation of the -- of the maintenance of

07: the cold temperatures in the freezer?

08: A. Yes.

09: Q. And do the annular lines go through the

10: vacuum space?

11: A. They do.

12: Q. Is there anything other than insulation in

13: the vacuum space -- let me rephrase that.

14: Is there anything other than insulation and

15: the annular lines inside the vacuum space?

16: A. Yes.

17: Q. What else?

18: A. There is a gettering system that absorbs
19: gas molecules that enter into the vacuum space after
20: it is sealed off.
21: Q. Is there anything else in the vacuum space?
22: A. No.
23: Q. And did you say that the gettering system
24: would collect molecules that enter the vacuum space
25: after it's been sealed?

(continued page 00022)

0022

01: A. Yes.
02: Q. How would anything enter the vacuum space
03: after it's been sealed?
04: A. There are multiple ways. The stainless
05: steel material used for the inner and outer wall out
06: gases molecules throughout the life of the
07: container, and small gas molecules can migrate
08: through the walls over time.
09: Q. Any other methods for molecules to get into
10: the vacuum space?
11: A. Molecules mainly make their way through
12: small molecular-size openings throughout the
13: assembly over time.
14: Q. Even with the vacuum in place?
15: A. Yes.
16: Q. What types of molecules does the stainless
17: steel outgas?
18: A. Mostly hydrogen.
19: Q. And what type of molecules would migrate
20: through the stainless steel over time?
21: A. Any molecule of gas that is in the

22: atmosphere can migrate through the structure.

23: Q. And as for the stainless steel off-gassing

24: throughout its life, you said mostly hydrogen.

25: Is there something other than hydrogen that

(continued page 00023)

0023

01: it would off gas?

02: A. None that I'm aware of. As far as I know,

03: hydrogen is the -- is the molecule that outgasses

04: from the material.

05: Q. And it would off-gas the hydrogen in a gas

06: format?

07: A. Yes. I mean, it releases molecules, and

08: the pressures are low enough that it's in the

09: gaseous state. The temperature is warm enough that

10: it's in a gaseous state.

11: Q. What other state could hydrogen be in?

12: A. Hydrogen can be in a liquid state. If you

13: get cold enough, it could be in a solid state, but

14: that generally does not happen here. Some other

15: planet in the system where it's colder than you can

16: get it here might freeze it.

17: Q. So for hydrogen to be in a solid state, it

18: would have to be at a level of cold that is not

19: reasonably possible?

20: A. Correct.

21: Q. How does the volume of the molecule of

22: hydrogen in a gaseous compare to its volume in a

23: liquid state?

24: A. I do not know that off the top of my head.

25: Q. Do you have any opinion on the comparison?

(continued page 00024)

0024

01: A. Well, at the molecular level, there's no --

02: there's no difference. The molecule size is

03: consistent whether it be in a gaseous or a liquid

04: state. When the molecules come together in

05: insufficient quantity at the right pressure it's a

06: liquid. Otherwise it's a gas.

07: Q. And the annular lines pass through the

08: vacuum space and then open into the inner vessel,

09: correct?

10: A. Correct.

11: Q. And where is that opening?

12: A. It is near the bottom of the shell of the

13: inner container, just above the inner bottom head of

14: the container. Probably an inch or so above the

15: head. Probably two inches above the ultimate bottom

16: of the container.

17: Q. And why are they in that location?

18: A. To measure the weight of the liquid column

19: that is in the freezer to determine what the liquid

20: level in the freezer is. You want the entry port to

21: be as close to the bottom of the container as

22: possible.

23: Q. When it reads the level, is it reading just

24: from the level of that port opening?

25: A. It does read from the weight of the liquid

(continued page 00025)

0025

01: column that's above the port.

Page 00025

08: Q. When the annular lines were added to the
09: design, was there any testing done of the tank at
10: that time?

11: MR. SMITH: Vague.

12: A. There was no testing done.

13: BY MS. ZEMAN:

14: Q. Was there any quality assessment done?

15: A. No.

16: Q. Was there any risk analysis done?

17: A. No.

18: Q. Does the MVE 808 have a false bottom?

19: A. Yes.

20: Q. And what does that mean?

21: A. It's just an aluminum disk that is placed

22: in the bottom to provide a level surface for the

23: inventory system to be placed on. The bottom head

24: is not flat, so a level surface is required for the

25: inventory system, so a false bottom is installed to

(continued page 00026)

0026

01: provide that.

02: Q. How much space is below the false bottom?

03: A. Perhaps an inch, but I do not know for

04: certain.

05: Q. And would it be a uniform inch?

06: A. No.

07: Q. Why not?

08: A. The inner bottom head being -- having flat

09: surfaces, when a vacuum is pulled on the back side

10: of it, it deforms and becomes not flat. So at the

11: outer edges where it connects to the inner shell,

12: the distance between the false bottom and the head
13: would be smaller than it would be as you approach
14: the center.
15: Q. So when you say about an inch below, would
16: that be your estimate for the deepest gap, the
17: biggest gap between the false bottom and the head?
18: A. Yes.
19: Q. Do you know what the volume of space is
20: below the false bottom?
21: A. I do not.
22: Q. What is the proper process to fill an MVE
23: 808 with liquid nitrogen?
24: MR. SMITH: Vague. Outside the scope.
25: BY MS. ZEMAN:

(continued page 00027)

0027

01: Q. Go ahead.
02: A. So there's two different processes. One
03: applies to a freezer with the autofill assembly
04: installed, and another applies to the freezer that
05: does not have an autofill system installed.
06: Which system do you want?
07: BY MS. ZEMAN:
08: Q. Let's start with the autofill.
09: A. With an autofill system, you would connect
10: a transfer hose from a liquid supply to the inlet
11: connection to the plumbing assembly, and then open
12: the supply valve at the liquid source, plug the
13: power supply in; and the controller, after it boots
14: up, will open the fill valves and allow liquid
15: nitrogen to pass into the freezer. It will then

16: monitor the level during that fill proceeds, and
17: close the valves and stop the flow of liquid
18: nitrogen into the freezer when the level reaches to
19: a programmed high fill setting.
20: Q. And if the tank were being put into service
21: for the first time, would it start that process at
22: room temperature?
23: A. Yes.
24: Q. Does Chart provide instructions for end
25: users to initiate a fill?

(continued page 00028)

0028

01: A. Yes.
02: Q. And to initiate a fill for an empty tank?
03: A. Just as I've just described.
04: Q. Where are those instructions?
05: A. There is a quick start guide that is
06: provided the freezer, and there is a technical
07: manual that is available for the freezer.
08: Q. Is the quick start guide physically
09: provided with the freezer?
10: A. Yes.
11: Q. And what would be the procedure without an
12: autofill?
13: A. You would connect the liquid transfer hose
14: to the liquid supply, stall a face separator at the
15: other end of the transfer hose, place that face
16: separator inside the freezer, and open the valve to
17: supply liquid from the supply.
18: Q. And that procedure, again, would be
19: starting at room temperature?

20: A. If -- if the freezer is -- if it's the
21: first fill, yes, it would be starting from room
22: temperature.
23: Q. You mentioned that the vacuum space on the
24: MVE 808 contains insulation.
25: A. Yes.

(continued page 00029)

0029

01: Q. What is that insulation?
02: A. It's a multi-layer insulation. There is a
03: layer of foil and a layer of what's called paper,
04: which is a fiberglass-based paper that are
05: interleaved, and there's 30 layers of this
06: alternating material.
07: Q. The first layer that you referred to, did
08: you say full?
09: A. Foil, aluminum foil.
10: Q. So the first layer is aluminum foil?
11: A. One of the layers is aluminum foil, yes.
12: Q. And then the aluminum foil alternates with
13: the fiberglass-based paper?
14: A. Yes.
15: Q. And is it 30 layers total?
16: A. Yes. Well, there would be 30 layers of
17: each material.
18: Q. So a total of 60 layers.
19: A. Correct.
20: Q. What's the outer layer?
21: A. Well, it does not matter which layer is the
22: outer as long as the inner layer and the outer layer
23: are not the same material.

24: Q. How much insulation is inside a single MVE

25: 808?

(continued page 00030)

0030

01: A. I -- other than, you know, 30 total layers

02: of each material, I couldn't say how much it is.

03: That information is available in our system, but I

04: don't know it off the top of my head.

05: Q. Where in your system is that information?

06: A. It's on the bill of material.

07: Q. What's the bill of material?

08: A. Bill of material, that -- that's the --

09: essentially a list of the material that the part

10: numbers and quantities of materials that are used to

11: build the freezer.

12: Q. Would the bill of material for the MVE 808

13: essentially list the materials and quantities needed

14: to build a single MVE 808 freezer?

15: A. Yes.

16: Q. And that document would be titled just bill

17: of material?

18: A. Yes.

Page 00031

Plaintiffs Objections 402 relevance; 403 waste of time :

08: Q. Is the insulation absorbant?

09: A. No.

10: Q. Has the insulation material changed on the

11: MVE 808?

12: A. No.

13: Q. It's been the same since it was originally

14: designed?

15: A. It has been the same since I became
16: involved with the product.
17: Q. And when was that again?
18: A. The mid-'90s.

Page 00032

16: Q. And does the MVE 808 contain a molecular
17: sieve material?
18: A. It did contain a molecular sieve.
19: Q. And what is that material?
20: A. The name of it is Cryo-Sieve. What the
21: actual material is, I don't know.

Plaintiffs Objections 403 waste of time :

22: Q. Is Cryo-Sieve a brand?
23: A. It is a brand.
24: Q. And who produces?
25: A. Arkema, A-r-k-e-m-a.

(continued page 00033)

0033

01: Q. And has Cryo-Sieve been the molecular
02: material for the MVE 808 since the '90s?
03: A. Yes.
04: Q. And are there any other terms used within
05: Chart for the sieve material?
06: A. No.
07: Q. Is it sometimes referred to as getter?
08: A. Yes.
09: Q. Any other terms like that?
10: A. No.
11: Q. So sieve or getter would be the only terms
12: used to refer to it other than, perhaps, Cryo-Sieve?
13: A. Yes.

14: Q. Can you describe that material?

15: A. It is a small pellet, about a 16th-inch

16: diameter, that is very porous.

17: Q. Did you say you don't know the exact

18: material?

19: A. Correct, I do not.

20: Q. What do you mean by "very porous"?

21: A. It's an actual -- the actual surface area

22: that's exposed to the vacuum space is several

23: hundred times larger than what you would expect of a

24: 1/16th-inch pellet. It probably has at least as

25: much void area in it as it has actual sieve

(continued page 00034)

0034

01: material.

02: Q. What is the purpose of that void area?

03: A. To allow gas molecules to enter into the

04: pellet.

Plaintiffs Objections 602 speculation; incomplete hypothetical:

05: Q. What happens once the gas molecules get

06: into the pellet?

07: MR. SMITH: Incomplete hypothetical.

08: A. It captures the molecule. The molecule is

09: captured by the pellet and kept there.

10: BY MS. ZEMAN:

11: Q. That means the molecule is unable to escape

12: the pellet?

13: MR. SMITH: Same objection.

14: A. The pellet absorbs -- it captures molecules

15: more efficiently as it gets colder. When the pellet

16: warms up, it will release that molecule.

17: BY MS. ZEMAN:

18: Q. How much does it have to warm up to release
19: the molecule?
20: MR. SMITH: Incomplete hypothetical.
21: A. There's a linear relationship there. As it
22: warms up, it releases more and more material as it
23: gets warmer and warmer.

Page 00037

10: Q. Okay. And the first item under -- on the
11: parts list is described as "SIEVE MOLECULAR
12: CRYOSIEVE 1/16th PALLADIUM OXIDE 76-80%-40 Mesh"; is
13: that correct?
14: A. No. The first item is "SIEVE MOLECULE
15: CRYOSIEVE 1/16th". The second item is "PALLADIUM
16: OXIDE 76-80%-40 MESH." Those are two part numbers.
17: Q. Okay. And what's the difference between
18: those two parts?
19: A. The -- they are both part of the gettering
20: system. The molecular sieve is what we've discussed
21: already. The palladium oxide reacts with hydrogen
22: and converts it to water, and the water vapor is
23: then absorbed by the molecular sieve.
24: Q. What are all of the elements of the
25: gettering system?

(continued page 00038)

0038

01: A. Those two are it.
02: Q. When you refer to the palladium oxide
03: reacting with hydrogen and converting it to water,
04: is it converting it to liquid water or gaseous
05: water?
06: A. It would be gaseous water.

07: Q. And where is that hydrogen coming from that
08: it's converting?
09: A. Hydrogen is out-gassed from the stainless
10: steel material of the container, and it can also
11: migrate through the material over time.
12: Q. Does the palladium oxide convert anything
13: other than hydrogen?
14: A. Not to my knowledge.
15: Q. And does the molecular sieve absorb
16: anything other than gas molecules?
17: A. No.
18: Q. And what gases other than hydrogen are you
19: familiar with being inside the vacuum space of a
20: freezer?
21: A. Any gas molecule that's found in the
22: atmosphere.

Page 00039

11: Q. Where are the molecular sieve and the
12: palladium oxide located inside the MVE 808?
13: A. The molecular sieve is -- is contained in a
14: depression that is formed in the inner bottom head.
15: The palladium oxide is in a packet form that is just
16: placed inside the vacuum space.
17: Q. Where inside the vacuum space?
18: A. Typically they would place it on the
19: insulation that covers the inner bottom head before
20: the outer vessel is installed.
21: Q. How big is the packet?
22: A. Couple inches long, maybe a quarter inch in
23: diameter.
24: Q. And is it just a single packet of palladium

25: oxide in each MVE 808?

(continued page 00040)

0040

01: A. I believe so, yes.

Page 00040

14: Q. Is the sieve material placed in some sort

15: of pan?

16: A. In the case of the 808, there is a

17: depression formed in the inner bottom head so that

18: the pan is not required. It is captured in that

19: depression by a sheet of stainless that is placed

20: over it and tack welded to the inner bottom head.

Page 00042

11: Q. Why does the MVE 808 contain molecular

12: sieve and palladium oxide?

13: MR. SMITH: Asked and answered.

14: A. It -- it is there to capture molecules of

15: gas that enter the vacuum space after it is

16: evacuated and sealed off.

17: BY MS. ZEMAN:

18: Q. Why is it necessary to do that?

19: A. Because gas is -- gaseous molecules are

20: entering the vacuum space continuously from the time

21: it is sealed off.

22: Q. Why do they need to be captured? Why can't

23: they just stay in the vacuum space?

24: A. The major part of the insulation that

25: allows it to contain in cryogenic liquid without

(continued page 00043)

0043

01: substantial evaporation of the cryogenic liquid and

02: condensation or ice on the exterior, that requires a
03: vacuum, and if enough molecules enter the vacuum
04: space, there's no longer a vacuum and that vacuum
05: insulation no longer exists.
06: Q. Why would the presence of gas molecules
07: cause there to not be a vacuum?
08: A. The definition of a vacuum is the absence
09: of stuff. So those molecules, when they enter --
10: you know, if they fill up the vacuum space, it's no
11: longer a vacuum.

Page 00049

Defense Objections Inadmissible other occurrence evidence not previously ruled on; not substantially similar; FRE 403/802/803:

13: Q. And how did you determine that the sieve
14: material had released molecules?
15: A. Because the pressure in the vacuum space
16: increased above ambient.
17: Q. Could anything else have caused the
18: increase in pressure other than a release of
19: molecules from the sieve?
20: A. If liquid nitrogen had entered the vacuum
21: space, it could cause the pressure to increase above
22: ambient.
23: Q. How would that occur?
24: MR. SMITH: Incomplete hypothetical.
25: A. In its liquid form, it is much more dense

(continued page 00050)

0050

01: than in its gaseous perform. So when it enters the
02: vacuum space, it is no longer insulated from ambient
03: temperatures. It will evaporate at a higher rate
04: and its volume dramatically increases, thus
05: dramatically increasing its pressure, thus it

06: could -- that pressure could increase to a pressure
07: above ambient pressure.

Page 00056

23: Q. How is the vacuum space sealed on an MVE
24: 808?
25: A. Well, the --

(continued page 00057)

0057

01: MR. SMITH: Let me just object. Vague and
02: overbroad. Go ahead.
03: A. The -- the weld seams where the heads and
04: shelves and neck are welded together are a sealing
05: point, as is the evacuation port where the vacuum
06: space is evacuated to create the vacuum is sealed
07: with a plug with O-rings.
08: Q. Other than at the evacuation port, is the
09: vacuum space sealed by a weld?
10: A. Other than at the evacuation port, yes, all
11: of the other welds make all the other seals in the
12: system.
13: Q. And what material is used to form a weld?
14: A. Typically it's a 308 stainless steel
15: material. That is what is commonly used when
16: welding 304 stainless.
17: Q. Is it machine-welded or hand-welded?
18: A. The 808 specifically?
19: Q. Correct.
20: A. To my knowledge, it's all hand-welded.

Page 00061

13: Q. Are there quality assurance measures in
14: place to ensure the welds are done properly?

15: A. Yes.

16: Q. What are those measures?

17: A. There is a visual inspection for the

18: cosmetic appearance, and the heated mass

19: spectrometer test is done to identify any ingress

20: points that would need to be corrected before it is

21: evacuated.

22: Q. Are the quality assurance measures applied

23: for every single tank?

24: A. Yes.

25: Q. So I think you had identified a visual

(continued page 00062)

0062

01: inspection and the mass spec test. Are there any

02: others?

03: A. For welding?

04: Q. Correct.

05: A. Those are the tests that -- you know, the

06: inspections that are done prior to evacuation.

07: After evacuation, there is a warm vacuum check that

08: is done to measure the vacuum, which is another

09: indicator that any ingress points larger than what

10: mass spec is looking for do not exist after it has

11: been evacuated and sealed off.

12: Q. What is a warm vacuum check?

13: A. It's simply measuring the vacuum pressure

14: in the vacuum space of the individual unit after it

15: has been evacuated on -- by the main vacuum

16: manifold.

17: Q. It's checking the pressure within the

18: vacuum space?

19: A. Yes.

20: Q. How does it do that?

21: A. There is a fixture that attaches to the

22: evacuation port of the individual unit, and it has

23: an operator that can remove the plug that seals the

24: vacuum port. And on the other end of it, it has an

25: evacuation port identical to the one that's on the

(continued page 00063)

0063

01: unit that will allow that -- the volume of that

02: fixture to be evacuated.

03: There is a gauge port for measuring the

04: vacuum pressure inside that volume attached to it,

05: and they attach it to the unit, evacuate that

06: volume, seal off the port at -- the evacuation port

07: of the fixture at that end, and then open the plug

08: to the vacuum space of the unit so that the volume

09: of the fixture is at the same pressure as the volume

10: of the vacuum space for the unit, and read that

11: pressure. Once that pressure is read, they seal off

12: the vacuum space for the unit and remove that

13: fixture.

14: Q. So prior to evacuation, the quality

15: assurance measures for the welds would be a visual

16: inspection and the mass spec test, and then after

17: the vacuum is evacuated, it would be the warm vacuum

18: check?

19: A. Yes.

Page 00063

22: Q. Okay. And what quality assurance is there

23: completed for the tank overall?

24: A. There is, again, a visual inspection for
25: cleanliness and to make sure that all required

(continued page 00064)

0064

01: components are installed, and then there's a
02: complete function test on all units that have an
03: autofill system installed.
04: Q. So a visual inspection and then a complete
05: function test for the units with autofill?
06: A. Yes.
07: Q. Anything else?
08: A. There is a normal evaporation test that is
09: done on a -- on a -- on a sample basis. It is
10: not -- not all units get that test. It's a sample
11: inspection.
12: Q. How many units get the NER test?
13: A. One per model per month.
14: Q. And how is that tank selected?
15: A. Typically it would be the first -- a unit
16: from the first work order of a particular model
17: built each month chosen at random from that -- from
18: that batch.
19: Q. So for the tank, overall, the quality
20: assurance measures are visual inspection, the
21: complete function test for those units with
22: autofill, and the NER test on a sample basis?
23: A. Yes.

Page 00065

01: Q. And how is the NER test done?
02: A. They would fill it with liquid nitrogen to
03: a level prescribed by the work instruction. I

04: don't -- I couldn't quote that value off the top of
05: my head. I know the general process. And then it
06: would be set aside and allowed to cool down the mass
07: of the inner container to reach a state of thermal
08: equilibrium.
09: It would then -- they would then take a
10: weight with a scale recording the date and time and
11: the weight, and then they would set it aside again
12: for a prescribed amount of time prescribed by the
13: work instruction, at which point a second weight
14: would be taken and recording the weight, date and
15: time. And those values would be used to calculate
16: an evaporation rate in liters per day. That number
17: would be compared to the allowable value that's in
18: the work instruction as a pass/fail criteria.

Page 00065

21: Q. For the three quality assurance measures
22: you identified for the welds, are those done for
23: every single tank?
24: A. Yes.
25: Q. And is the material used for the welds on

(continued page 00066)

0066

01: the MVE 808 supplied from the same supplier for all
02: MVE 808s?
03: A. Yes.

Page 00067

08: Q. Are you aware of weld failures occurring on
09: Chart tanks?
10: MR. SMITH: Vague.
11: A. What do you mean by "weld failure"?

12: BY MS. ZEMAN:

13: Q. The weld failing to seal.

14: A. I am aware that on occasion welds do fail

15: to seal, but those failures to seal would be

16: normally detected by the mass spec process and would

17: be corrected before evacuation. Any that weren't

18: found in the mass spec process should be indicated

19: by an elevated pressure at the warm vacuum test,

20: which would cause it to be rerouted back into

21: production to -- to locate any ingress points that

22: are -- you know, that have gone above what the mass

23: spec test is looking for and, again, correct it, and

24: it would go back through evacuation.

25: Q. Are you aware of any weld failures being

(continued page 00068)

0068

01: detected in the field?

02: A. I can't say that I do, no.

03: Q. Are you aware of any instance where a crack

04: has been detected in a weld on a Chart stainless

05: steel freezer?

06: A. I can't say that I recall hearing of that.

Page 00070

10: Does Chart recommend that its stainless

11: steel freezers be fully thawed at any point?

12: A. Yes.

13: Q. Where does Chart recommend that?

14: A. It is -- I believe it is in the technical

15: manual. I do not know if it is in any other

16: document, but I believe it is in the technical

17: manual.

18: Q. And what are the circumstances under which
19: Chart recommends a tank be thawed?
20: MR. SMITH: Vague. Best evidence.
21: A. It is recommended that it be taken out of
22: service and warmed up to get all of the moisture out
23: of it at some interval. I do not recall what that
24: interval is at this point. But ice does accumulate
25: inside of a freezer over time, and it should be

(continued page 00071)

0071

01: taken out of service at some interval to remove that
02: moisture from the container.
03: BY MS. ZEMAN:
04: Q. And is the expectation that the freezer
05: would be put back in service after doing this thaw?
06: A. Yes.

Page 00075

06: Q. How is the vacuum drawn on an MVE 808?
07: A. There is a manifold, which is a long pipe,
08: that is evacuated by a vacuum pump, and that pipe
09: has ports along its length with valves to seal those
10: ports off. A hose is connected between the --
11: those -- a valve at the port to the evacuation port
12: on the individual unit, and the valve at the port on
13: the manifold is opened to allow gas to be drawn from
14: the vacuum space of the individual unit to evacuate
15: it.
16: Q. And how is the plug put in place?
17: A. There's a fixture, cylindrical fixture,
18: with a pipe coming out the side that the hose is
19: connected to. There is a plunger that is threaded

20: at one end to fit the threads in the center of the
21: plug, and that -- that plunger has a T handle at the
22: top. And before the fixture is attached to the
23: unit, the plunger is threaded into the plug, and the
24: plug is retracted back up into the fixture, and the
25: fixture is placed on the evacuation port on the

(continued page 00076)

0076

01: freezer.
02: Once the -- once the evacuation is
03: complete, that plunger is used to push the plug down
04: into the body of the evacuation port, and it's
05: threaded back out of the plug and the fixture
06: removed from the unit.
07: Q. How do you know the evacuation is complete?
08: A. The pressure of the complete manifold is
09: monitored throughout the evacuation process. And
10: when the vacuum pressure in the manifold drops below
11: a value prescribed in the work instruction, then it
12: is assumed that all of the units connected to the
13: manifold have been evacuated below that vacuum
14: pressure as well, and they are then sealed off, and
15: they go to the warm vacuum check station to confirm
16: the vacuum level in the individual unit.

Page 00077

13: Q. And when is the getter placed inside the
14: unit in relation to drawing the vacuum?
15: A. It is installed during the assembly
16: process. The sieve is attached, you know -- is
17: either in that depression, in the case of the 808,
18: or in other freezers. It's -- there's a pan for

19: that. But that is part of the inner vessel
20: assembly. It is attached, and the sieve is put in
21: place before the multi-layer insulation wrap is
22: applied.

Plaintiffs Objections 602 speculation:

23: So I don't know how to place that relative
24: to the evacuation, but that's probably about halfway
25: through the assembly process prior to evacuation.

Page 00078

21: Q. The depression that the sieve material sits
22: in, is that depression in the inner vessel or the
23: outer vessel?
24: A. It is the inner vessel. The sieve needs to
25: get cold to absorb as much material as it can. The

(continued page 00079)

0079

01: sieve would be ineffective attached to the outer.
02: Q. The sieve is not in the inner vessel in the
03: sense of being exposed to liquid nitrogen when the
04: tank is in use, correct?
05: A. Correct, it is not in the inner vessel. It
06: is on the vacuum side of the inner vessel.
07: Q. And is the stainless steel sheet that you
08: referred to tacked to the bottom of the inner
09: vessel?
10: A. Yes.

Page 00094

19: Q. What is an annular line?
20: A. Well, it is line that passes through the
21: vacuum space, generally speaking. It is called an
22: annular line because the vacuum space is technically

23: referred to as the anulus.

24: Q. What is the purpose of those two annular

25: lines?

(continued page 00095)

0095

01: A. One is to allow a pressure reading to

02: measure the level of liquid nitrogen in the freezer.

03: The other is used for introducing more liquid

04: nitrogen into the freezer for filling.

05: Q. So one is a fill line and the other one is

06: a level reading line?

07: A. Level sensor line.

08: Q. Level sensor line. How does the level

09: sensor line function?

10: MR. SMITH: Asked and answered.

11: A. The weight of the liquid nitrogen above the

12: port in the freezer has a pressure associated with

13: it that is greater than ambient pressure,

14: differential pressure. That -- the top end of that

15: tube is connected through the plumbing to the

16: differential pressure sensor inside the controller,

17: and it monitors that pressure and calculates the

18: liquid level in the freezer based on that pressure,

19: and displays it, and also uses it to determine when

20: it needs to fill -- initiate a fill and to end a

21: fill.

22: Q. Did you say that the level it calculates is

23: displayed on the controller?

24: A. Yes.

25: Q. Does the level calculated always match the

(continued page 00096)

0096

01: actual liquid nitrogen level in the tank?

02: MR. SMITH: Incomplete hypothetical.

03: A. Well, it is difficult to physically measure

04: the level that's actually in the freezer. So, you

05: know, we provide a level measurement stick to be

06: used to take a manual measurement. Everyone reads

07: that measurement differently because it causes the

08: liquid to boil when you put the stick in it, which

09: causes the frost line to be above the actual liquid

10: level in the freezer. And everyone that I have ever

11: seen use that method to measure interprets that

12: level differently. Some add, some subtract to the

13: frost line.

14: So it can be made to agree exactly with an

15: individual's measurement with the measuring stick.

16: But the next person that throws the measuring stick

17: in there might read that stick differently and

18: decide that what's on the display doesn't agree with

19: it.

Page 00103

21: Q. When the tank is filled through the annular

22: fill line, does that line expand or contract as the

23: liquid nitrogen goes through it?

24: A. When it's cooled, it will contract.

25: Q. Is that to say that when liquid nitrogen

(continued page 00104)

0104

01: first starts to go through the fill line, the line

02: would contract?

03: A. As it is cooled, it will contract. It will

04: not initially come down to liquid nitrogen
05: temperature when you first start flowing liquid
06: nitrogen through it. There's a time delay before
07: the material actually begins to cool down. But once
08: it does begin to cool down, it will contract.

09: BY MS. ZEMAN:

10: Q. Prior to a fill, would the annular fill
11: line be at ambient temperature?

12: A. On the initial fill it would. On
13: subsequent fills, the top end where it enters the
14: head would be near ambient temperature. The bottom
15: end of the tube where it enters the inner vessel
16: would be near liquid nitrogen temperature.

17: Q. And in either instance, as you started to
18: fill, it would begin to cool as liquid nitrogen runs
19: through the tube?

20: MR. SMITH: Vague. Asked and answered.

21: A. It would.

22: BY MS. ZEMAN:

23: Q. And would that process where that annular
24: line is contracting as it cools, would that put any
25: stress on the weld line at the inner vessel?

(continued page 00105)

0105

01: MR. SMITH: Outside the scope. Calls for
02: expert opinion. Incomplete hypothetical.

03: A. From my perspective, yes, it would
04: introduce stress, but the material is capable of
05: handling an amount of stress. I don't know the
06: value off the top of my head. But that stress would
07: not come anywhere near enough stress to deform the

08: material.

09: Q. Has any testing been done to evaluate the
10: stress put on the weld?

11: A. No.

12: Q. By Chart or by MVE?

13: A. Not to my knowledge.

14: Q. Do you know why no testing has been done?

15: A. It was not believed that it was necessary.

16: Q. At what angle does the fill line enter the
17: inner vessel?

18: A. The fill line itself is vertical. It makes
19: a 90-degree turn in the elbow. And the elbow, you
20: know, the liquid enters horizontally into the inner
21: vessel.

22: Q. And does the sensor line connect with the
23: 90-degree elbow?

24: A. Yes.

25: Q. Is it the same elbow construction?

(continued page 00106)

0106

01: A. It is the same part number. It is the same
02: elbow.

Page 00107

24: Q. Well, what would you -- where does Chart
25: manufacture stainless steel freezers?

(continued page 00108)

0108

01: A. Ball Ground, Georgia.

Page 00108

11: Q. Is the MVE 808 manufactured in Ball Ground?
12: A. It is.

13: Q. How long has it been manufactured there?

14: A. Sometime in the mid-'90s. Previously, MVE

Page 00110

07: Q. What is the expected service life for the

08: MVE 808?

09: A. I believe it's ten years.

10: Q. Do you know how that was determined?

11: A. I do not.

12: Q. Do you know what tests or other analysis

13: was done to identify ten years?

14: A. I do not.

15: Q. What does expected service life mean?

16: A. It means that it would -- it should perform

17: similar to new for that period of time.

Page 00113

22: Q. Does failure mode effects -- and effects

23: analysis sound familiar?

24: A. Yeah, that's it.

25: Q. That's what FMEA analysis is?

(continued page 00114)

0114

01: A. Yeah.

02: Q. And is that the same thing as risk

03: analysis?

04: MR. SMITH: Vague.

05: A. It is similar. The analysis that we did

06: for regulatory compliance was a risk analysis and --

07: but the label on it is the FMEA.

08: (Plaintiffs' Exhibit 159 marked.)

09: BY MS. ZEMAN:

10: Q. And I am going to hand you a document

11: that's been marked as Exhibit 159. If you could
12: take a look at that.
13: A. Okay.
14: Q. Mr. Brooks, do you recognize what this
15: document is?
16: A. I do.
17: Q. What is this?
18: A. It is the DFMECA analysis for Chart's
19: cryogenic freezers.
20: Q. And what is DFMECA analysis?
21: A. Design failure mode -- I can't remember
22: what all of the letters stand for. Maybe it's in
23: here somewhere.
24: Q. Is it failure modes and effects criticality
25: analysis?

(continued page 00115)

0115

01: A. Yeah, that sounds right.
02: Q. And what is this used for at Chart?
03: A. It is required for compliance to the
04: European Medical Device Directive, and the intent is
05: to look at all of the characteristics and features
06: of a product and make some assumptions about what
07: types of malfunctions could occur, and grade them
08: for frequency of occurrence, severity of occurrence,
09: and the risk involved.

Page 00128

23: Q. Does any failure mode in this dewar section
24: involve the release of absorbed molecules from the
25: molecular sieve?

(continued page 00129)

0129

01: A. Well, whenever -- whenever the inner vessel
02: warms up, molecules will be released from the sieve.
03: So if -- if, as a result of any of those modes, the
04: inner vessel were to warm up, then it would release
05: molecules from the sieve.

06: Q. Is that identified, though, in this DFMECA
07: document?

08: A. I would have to read through it to
09: determine that. DEW-12, dewar sieve.

10: Q. That failure mode refers to the sieve
11: becoming saturated, correct?

12: A. Correct.

13: Q. Where does it refer to the sieve releasing
14: molecules?

15: A. It doesn't specifically, but once it is
16: saturated, and there's a vacuum failure, then it
17: would warm up and potentially release molecules from
18: the sieve.

19: Q. Why do you say "potentially"?

20: A. Well, I mean, all of this is really the
21: group speculating what could happen. And, yeah, if
22: the sieve is indeed saturated, holding all of the
23: molecules that it can hold, then any warmup of the
24: sieve would release -- it doesn't say it
25: specifically there, but that's the only line item

(continued page 00130)

0130

01: that I saw that referred to the sieve.

02: Q. What would you need to know to determine
03: how quickly 14 inches of liquid nitrogen would burn
04: off of an MVE 808?

05: MR. SMITH: Outside the scope. Calls for
06: speculation. Incomplete hypothetical.

07: A. If I knew the actual evaporation rate test
08: result and the -- and I knew that the freezer was
09: left undisturbed, an estimate -- an estimation could
10: be made using that consumption rate, evaporation
11: rate, and the estimate of the actual level in the
12: freezer. All of our tests are done static with
13: nobody disturbing the freezer in any way and with --
14: with nothing stored in the freezer.

15: So, you know, to be as accurate as possible
16: would have to have an evaporation test done with
17: some -- you know, whatever they're storing -- stored
18: in the freezer so that the impact of that on the
19: consumption rate would be known.

20: So, you know, the original test value from
21: the production test would not apply to a freezer
22: that has something stored in it because that
23: inventory and the inventory system it's stored in
24: has an impact on the consumption rate.

Page 00138

11: Q. Does Chart recommend that end users monitor
12: liquid nitrogen usage?

13: A. They do recommend that they monitor the
14: usage that is calculated and displayed by the
15: controller.

Page 00139

19: Q. What are the signs of vacuum failure on a

20: cryogenic tank?

21: MR. SMITH: Overbroad. Outside the scope.

22: A. Increased consumption can be an indicator

23: of vacuum degradation. Condensation or frost on the

24: outside surface of a freezer where it normally would

25: not occur can be an indication of vacuum

(continued page 00140)

0140

01: degradation. Those are the main things that come to

02: mind.

03: Q. So increased consumption of liquid

04: nitrogen, condensation and frost?

05: A. Yes.

06: Q. Why would frost occur?

07: A. When the insulation system degrades, then

08: heat transfer allows the outside surface to be

09: cooled by the liquid that is inside, and that can

10: become cool enough to cause frost to accumulate if

11: there is moisture in the air.

Page 00203

14: Q. At the bottom of this email from Ramon --

15: it's on the next page --

16: A. Uh-huh.

17: Q. -- last paragraph says, "We should plan to

18: take action immediately as we have just experienced

19: another 10 or so controllers that failed because the

20: SN is showing '0.'"

21: Do you see that?

22: A. I see that.

23: Q. Okay. Chart did not take action

24: immediately, correct?

25: MR. SMITH: Asked and answered.

(continued page 00204)

0204

01: A. They -- they did not take action on the

02: hardware implementation.

03: BY MR. WOLF:

04: Q. So this was written in February of 2016.

05: A. Okay.

06: Q. Did Chart take action immediately with

07: regard to this issue in any way?

08: MR. SMITH: Vague.

09: A. There -- there may have been -- you know,

10: the electronics guys may have looked into

11: alternative methods, but I can't say what they might

12: have considered his response to this. I don't know.

13: BY MR. WOLF:

14: Q. Okay. As you sit here today speaking for

15: Chart, can you list for me any actions that Chart

16: took immediately with regard to this issue from

17: February 29th, 2016?

18: A. I couldn't tell you.

19: Q. Okay. Two paragraphs up from that, Ramon

20: writes, "We should modify the technical manual to

21: update the customer to be sure to use shielded

22: network cables."

23: Chart did not do that, correct?

24: A. I cannot answer that. I do not know.

25: Q. Okay. Let me ask the question differently.

(continued page 00205)

0205

01: You have no knowledge that Chart did that, correct?

02: A. That is correct.

03: Q. Okay. And not just about updating the

04: manual. You have no information that Chart told its

05: customers, in any way, to be sure to use shielded

06: network cables for their TEC300s, correct?

07: A. That's correct.

08: MR. SMITH: Calls for speculation.

09: BY MR. WOLF:

10: Q. He then writes, "We also need to modify our

11: existing OFAF Master cable and Daisy Chain Kits to

12: be sure they use shielded cables."

13: Do you see that?

14: A. I see that.

15: Q. Okay. You have no knowledge that Chart did

16: that, too, right?

17: A. Correct.

18: Q. What's an OFAF?

19: A. One Fill All Fill.

20: Q. Okay. What is an OFAF Master cable?

21: A. That is the cable that can connects between

22: two controllers to enable the One Fill All Fill

23: system to function.

24: Q. And what's a Daisy Chain Kit?

25: A. That is a cable, and basically it's an RJ45

(continued page 00206)

0206

01: network-type cable and a jack splitter, a jack T,

02: that allows more than one table to be connected to a

03: single RJ45 modular jack.

Page 00266

Defense Objections 602 - Speculation:

16: Q. Okay. You said you have seen people
17: manually measure liquid nitrogen in a freezer,
18: right?
19: A. Yes.
20: Q. Okay. And I think what you said is that
21: some people add or subtract to the ruler's frost
22: line to get what they believe is the accurate liquid
23: nitrogen measurements, right?
24: A. Yes.
25: Q. Okay. What's the range of how much people

(continued page 00267)

0267

01: add to and subtract from the ruler's frost line?
02: MR. SMITH: Calls for wild speculation and
03: incomplete hypothetical.
04: MR. WOLF: You know, it actually doesn't
05: because he's seen it.
06: MR. SMITH: You said all people.
07: A. I don't know what the range is. You know,
08: I've seen people add an inch, add a half inch,
09: subcontract an inch, subtract a half inch.
10: BY MR. WOLF:
11: Q. Okay. In that range.
12: A. Sure.